

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
MIDDLE DISTRICT OF TENNESSEE  
NASHVILLE DIVISION**

**IN RE: REALPAGE, INC., RENTAL  
SOFTWARE ANTITRUST LITIGATION  
(NO. II)**

**Case No. 3:23-MD-3071  
MDL No. 3071**

**This Document Relates to:  
3:22-cv-01082  
3:23-cv-00357**

**Chief Judge Waverly D. Crenshaw, Jr.**

**DEFENDANTS' REPLY IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO  
ENFORCE CLASS ACTION WAIVERS**

None of Plaintiffs' arguments avoid the fact that Plaintiffs Brandon Watters and Jeffrey Weaver agreed in their leases that they would not file a class action. Watters and Weaver provide no good reason the Court should not enforce their lease agreements as written, including the class waivers. The Court should grant this motion and strike these Plaintiffs' class allegations.

### **I. Plaintiffs Provide No Valid Reason to Delay Addressing This Issue.**

Plaintiffs' primary argument is that there are fact issues, and the Court should delay ruling until class certification.<sup>1</sup> But this is a strawman. Plaintiffs are no doubt correct that there are complex, individualized fact issues as to unnamed putative class members who signed their own class waivers in different states under a variety of circumstances. Mem. at 4 n.4 [Dkt. 338]. But Plaintiffs identify no fact disputes *as to Weaver and Watters* preventing enforcement of the waivers. These Plaintiffs allege they rented units from Lincoln and Camden. Their leases are undisputed and incorporated into the Multifamily FAC. *See* Mem. at 1 n.2. Weaver and Watters agreed not to file class actions; therefore, they should not be allowed to pursue class allegations and class discovery. *See* Mem. at 4 n.3.<sup>2</sup> The Court should enforce the terms of the waivers and reject Plaintiffs' delay request.

### **II. Federal Courts Regularly Enforce Class Action Waivers.**

Plaintiffs gloss over the twenty-some-odd cases from around the country enforcing class waivers like those here. Mem. at 7 n.8 (collecting cases enforcing standalone class action

---

<sup>1</sup> Plaintiffs cite the Court's decision *Lammert v. Auto-Owners (Mut.) Ins. Co.*, 415 F. Supp. 3d 807, 811 (M.D. Tenn. 2019), but that case is distinguishable. There, defendants moved to strike plaintiffs' class allegations to the extent they were based on a six-year limitations period. The Court denied the motion because this limitations period was not referenced in the Complaint. Here, Watters and Weaver incorporate their leases in the Multifamily FAC, and their leases state they will not file class actions.

<sup>2</sup> Many courts, including a court in this District, have exercised this discretion to strike class action allegations early in cases prior to discovery. *Bearden v. Honeywell Int'l Inc.*, 2010 WL 1223936, at \*9 (M.D. Tenn. Mar. 24, 2010); *see also* Mem. at 4, n.3 (collecting cases).

waivers).<sup>3</sup> Ignoring these authorities, Plaintiffs argue that there is “no federal statute or policy in favor of enforcing naked class action waiver clauses.” Opp’n at 9. But plaintiffs have no federal right to file class litigation. *Am. Express Co. v. Italian Colors Rest.*, 570 U.S. 228, 234 (2013) (explaining Rule 23 did not “establish an entitlement to class proceedings for the vindication of statutory rights”). The Supreme Court has made clear that neither the Sherman nor Clayton Acts mention class actions or suggest an intention to preclude class waivers. *Id.* at 234. Enforceability is governed by state law, and these waivers are enforceable under Tennessee and Colorado law. Mem. at 4–5.

### **III. Plaintiff Watters’s Lease Is Enforceable Under Tennessee Law.**

Plaintiffs’ only contract argument is that Watters’s class waiver supposedly is unconscionable. But Watters spent 18 minutes reviewing his lease and scrolled through it before signing. Ex. 1-A to Decl. of J. Stayton [Dkt. 337-1]. Watters also manifested consent by paying rent and occupying the unit according to the terms of the lease. Under Tennessee law, his lease is valid and enforceable.<sup>4</sup> And Plaintiffs have not shown and cannot show any procedural or substantive unconscionability under Tennessee law. *See Rubio v. Carreca Enters., Inc.*, 490 F. Supp. 3d 1277, 1289 (M.D. Tenn. 2020).<sup>5</sup>

---

<sup>3</sup> Plaintiffs have no counter to Defendants’ authorities other than *Martrano v. Quizno’s Franchise Co.*, 2009 WL 1704469, at \*21 (W.D. Pa. June 15, 2009). But the Court should disregard this outlier; a court in *Bonanno v. Quizno’s Franchise Co.*, 2009 WL 1068744, at \*12 (D. Colo. Apr. 20, 2009) addressed this same class waiver under Colorado law and upheld it. And at least one other court has declined to follow *Martrano*. *See In re May*, 595 B.R. 894, 903 (Bankr. E.D. Ark. 2019).

<sup>4</sup> *See Howard-Hill v. Spence*, 2017 WL 4544599, at \*7–8 (E.D. Tenn. Oct. 11, 2017) (holding unsigned leases enforceable when plaintiff manifested consent by performing and making payments conforming to their terms).

<sup>5</sup> Plaintiffs allege no facts evidencing unconscionability, and Tennessee law does not require fact discovery before a court can determine whether an agreement is unconscionable. *See Berent v. CMH Homes, Inc.*, 466 S.W.3d 740, 746–47 (Tenn. 2015).

Plaintiffs seek to distract the Court from applicable Tennessee law with unalleged speculation<sup>6</sup> about a supposed conspiracy to use the Texas Apartment Association (“TAA”) and National Apartment Association (“NAA”) form leases.<sup>7</sup> Plaintiffs cite *In re Currency Conversion Fee Antitrust Litig.*, 2012 WL 401113, at \*1 (S.D.N.Y. Feb. 8, 2012), which involved an alleged conspiracy to add class waivers in arbitration agreements to consumer contracts. *But see Ross v. Citigroup, Inc.*, 630 F. App’x 79, 81 (2d Cir. 2015), as corrected (Nov. 24, 2015) (no conspiracy found). Plaintiffs allege nothing similar here, and their unpled conspiracy theory provides no basis to evade the class waivers.

#### **IV. Plaintiff Weaver’s Class Action Waiver Is Enforceable Under Colorado Law.**

Plaintiffs insist that Plaintiff Weaver’s class waiver is not enforceable, but they ignore the basic principle of Colorado law that contracts are enforceable as written. *Allen v. Pacheco*, 71 P.3d 375, 378 (Colo. 2003); *Bonanno*, 2009 WL 1068744, at \*12 (enforcing class action waiver). Plaintiffs argue that Camden’s waiver does not cover the dispute at issue. But the waiver is not limited to any particular type of action. The language states that the “Resident waives any ability or right to serve as a representative party for others similarly situated or participate in a class action suit or claim against the Owner or the Owner’s managing agents.” *See, e.g.*, Ex. 2-A at 56 [Dkt. 337-2]. And the paragraph broadly covers all instances of “default” by owner.<sup>8</sup> *Id.*

Plaintiffs also argue that Camden’s class waiver is unenforceable because Weaver’s initial

---

<sup>6</sup> Plaintiffs, via the Dingman Declaration [Dkt. 378-1], seek to bring in facts outside of the Multifamily FAC; the Court should not consider the declaration and its attachments.

<sup>7</sup> Plaintiffs do not allege that the supposed conspiracy in this case included using TAA/NAA leases. Plaintiffs also ignore that Camden did *not* use the NAA lease and the language of the two waivers is different.

<sup>8</sup> Plaintiffs’ authority confirms that the effect of a contract should “be determined primarily from the language of the agreement itself.” *Draper v. DeFrenchi-Gordineer*, 282 P.3d 489, 494 (Colo. App. 2011). The broad language of the class waiver shows it is not limited to repair claims.

lease with Camden did not contain a waiver. But there is no dispute that the waiver was in Weaver's second lease with Camden, to which Weaver agreed. And no Colorado law bars a landlord from updating lease terms.<sup>9</sup> Plaintiffs also argue that Camden's lease is unenforceable as a contract of adhesion. Under Colorado law, the use of a standardized form among parties with unequal bargaining power does not necessarily create an unconscionable contract of adhesion. *Turner v. Chipotle Mexican Grill, Inc.*, 2018 WL 11314701, at \*3 (D. Colo. Aug. 3, 2018).<sup>10</sup> Plaintiffs also do not—and cannot—show that Weaver could not have sought similar services elsewhere, which defeats claims of procedural unconscionability. *See Bernal v. Burnett*, 793 F. Supp. 2d 1280, 1288 (D. Colo. 2011) (school enrollment contracts were not unconscionable contracts of adhesion, in part, because “Plaintiffs could have chosen to pursue their education elsewhere”).<sup>11</sup>

#### **V. Plaintiffs' Other Leases with Other Defendants are Immaterial.**

Plaintiffs also try to evade their class waivers by arguing that Watters and Weaver have other leases for some part of the class period that do not contain class action waivers. Opp'n at 2–3. But this is irrelevant. Watters and Weaver are asserting claims for the entire class period—

---

<sup>9</sup> Plaintiffs also point to a June 2023 Colorado law barring class action waivers (Opp'n at 10 n.10), but that law clearly states that it is not retroactive.

<sup>10</sup> Plaintiffs also argue that, under Colorado law, unconscionable contracts of adhesion are all contracts that are “not bargained for, but imposed on the public for a necessary service on a take it or leave it basis.” Opp'n at 10 n. 9 (citing *Bauer v. Aspen Highlands Skiing Corp.*, 788 F. Supp. 472, 474 (D. Colo. 1992)). But *Bauer* acknowledges “form contracts offered on a take it or leave it basis, alone, do not render the agreement an adhesion contract.” *Bauer*, 788 F. Supp. at 474–75.

<sup>11</sup> The *Allstate* decision Plaintiffs cite is not instructive. In *Allstate*, the Colorado Supreme Court interpreted an insurance contract that was divided into a number of delineated coverage “Parts” with an additional section devoted exclusively to “General Provisions.” *See Allstate Ins. Co. v. Huizar*, 52 P.3d 816, 819 (Colo. 2002). Here, the lease at issue is in a single part, with numbered paragraphs addressing specific issues. The class waiver is found within the *only* provision of the lease addressing the tenant's rights in the event of a default by the owner. *Allstate's* analysis of a complicated, multi-part insurance contract is irrelevant.

October 18, 2018 to the present—based on all their leases with any defendant. Multifamily FAC ¶¶ 35, 38, 394 [Dkt. 314]. Plaintiffs provide no authority that would allow them to ignore their class waivers with Lincoln and Camden, simply because they entered into leases with others.

#### **VI. Equitable Estoppel Allows All Defendants to Enforce the Class Waivers.**

Contrary to Plaintiffs’ unsupported argument, all Defendants can enforce the class waivers.<sup>12</sup> Plaintiffs insist that “[n]on-signatories under Tennessee law can only invoke equitable estoppel in situations where a signatory to the contract ‘attempts to hold the nonsignatory liable pursuant to the underlying agreement.’” Opp’n at 5 (quoting *Blue Water Bay at Ctr. Hill, LLC v. Hasty*, 2017 WL 5665410, at \*14 (Tenn. Ct. App. Nov. 27, 2017)). But *Blue Water Bay* only highlights why estoppel applies. The court there held estoppel applies when a signatory like Watters “raises allegations of concerted misconduct by both the nonsignatory and one or more signatories to the contract.” 2017 WL 5665410, at \*9. Watters alleges concerted misconduct among all Defendants. Thus, estoppel applies and all Defendants can enforce his class waiver.<sup>13</sup>

#### **CONCLUSION**

Defendants ask the Court to enforce the terms of Plaintiffs’ leases and the class action waivers therein and strike their class allegations.

---

<sup>12</sup> As to Weaver’s lease, at this time, only Camden seeks to enforce the class action waiver. Specifically, Camden moves to bar Weaver from serving as a class representative or participating in a class action against Camden, per the terms of Weaver’s lease. Other Defendants reserve the right to argue a class action bar based on the Camden lease at any class certification hearing. *Santich v. VCG Holding Corp.*, 443 P.3d 62, 65 (Colo. 2019), recognized that nonsignatories to a contract may be able to enforce its terms in certain circumstances.

<sup>13</sup> Because “Tennessee courts, to date, still have not addressed the ‘second scenario’ recognized in *Blue Water Bay*,” later decisions have looked to “other courts around the country,” which “have almost uniformly concluded that the plaintiff in this situation, particularly when the plaintiff alleges joint employment, is estopped from avoiding arbitration with the non-signatory.” *Green v. Mission Health Communities, LLC*, 2020 WL 6702866, at \*8 (M.D. Tenn. Nov. 13, 2020) (collecting cases); see also *In re Titanium Dioxide Antitrust Litig.*, 962 F. Supp. 2d 840, 851 (D. Md. 2013); *Ordosgoitti v. Werner Enters., Inc.*, 2022 WL 874600 (D. Neb. Mar. 24, 2022).

DATED: July 31, 2023

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Gregory J. Casas

Gregory J. Casas (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
Emily W. Collins (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
300 West 6th Street, Suite 2050  
Austin, TX 78701-4052  
Telephone: (512) 320-7200  
casasg@gtlaw.com  
emily.collins@gtlaw.com

Robert J. Herrington (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
1840 Century Park East, Suite 1900  
Los Angeles, CA 90067  
Telephone: (310) 586-7700  
Robert.Herrington@gtlaw.com

Becky L. Caruso (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
GREENBERG TRAURIG, LLP  
500 Campus Drive, Suite 400  
Florham Park, NJ 07932  
Telephone: (973) 443-3252  
Becky.Caruso@gtlaw.com

/s/ Ryan T. Holt

Ryan T. Holt (No. 30191)  
Mark Alexander Carver (No. 36754)  
SHERRARD ROE VOIGT & HARBISON, PLC  
150 Third Avenue South, Suite 1100  
Nashville, Tennessee 37201  
Telephone: (615) 742-4200  
rholt@srvhlaw.com  
acarver@srvhlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Lincoln Property  
Company*

/s/ Jay Srinivasan

Jay Srinivasan (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
jsrinivasan@gibsondunn.com  
Daniel G. Swanson (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
dswanson@gibsondunn.com  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
333 South Grand Avenue  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Telephone: (213) 229-7430

Stephen Weissman (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
sweissman@gibsondunn.com  
Michael J. Perry (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
mjperry@gibsondunn.com  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
1050 Connecticut Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: (202) 955-8678

Stephen C. Whittaker (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
cwhittaker@gibsondunn.com  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
1361 Michelson Drive  
Irvine, CA 92612  
Telephone: (212) 351-2671

Ben A. Sherwood (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
bsherwood@gibsondunn.com  
GIBSON, DUNN & CRUTCHER LLP  
200 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10166  
Telephone: (212) 351-2671

*Counsel for Defendant RealPage, Inc.*

/s/ Edwin Buffmire

Edwin Buffmire  
ebuffmire@jw.com  
Michael Moran  
mmoran@jw.com  
JACKSON WALKER LLP  
2323 Ross Ave., Suite 600  
Dallas, TX 75201  
Telephone: (214) 953-6000

Kevin Fulton  
kevin@fultonlg.com  
THE FULTON LAW GROUP PLLC  
7676 Hillmont St., Suite 191  
Houston, TX 77040  
Telephone: (713) 589-6964

*Counsel for Defendant Allied Orion Group, LLC*

/s/ Katie A. Reilly

Katie A. Reilly  
reilly@wtotrial.com  
Michael T. Williams  
williams@wtotrial.com  
Judith P. Youngman  
youngman@wtotrial.com  
WHEELER TRIGG O'DONNELL LLP  
370 Seventeenth Street, Suite 4500  
Denver, CO 80202  
Telephone: (303) 244-1800

Mark Bell  
Mark.Bell@hklaw.com  
HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP  
Nashville City Center  
511 Union Street, Suite 2700  
Nashville, TN 37219  
Telephone: (615) 850-8850

*Counsel for Defendant Apartment Income REIT Corp., d/b/a AIR Communities*



/s/ Danny David

Danny David  
danny.david@bakerbotts.com  
BAKER BOTTS LLP  
910 Louisiana Street  
Houston, TX 77002  
Telephone: (713) 229-4055

James Kress (*pro hac* forthcoming)  
james.kress@bakerbotts.com  
Paul Cuomo (*pro hac* forthcoming)  
paul.cuomo@bakerbotts.com  
BAKER BOTTS LLP  
700 K. Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20001  
Telephone: (202) 639-7884

*Counsel for Defendant Avenue5 Residential,  
LLC*

/s/ Matt T. Adamson

Matt T. Adamson  
madamson@jpcelaw.com  
JAMESON PEPPLER CANTU PLLC  
801 Second Avenue, Suite 700  
Seattle, WA 98104  
Telephone: (206) 292-1994

*Counsel for Defendant B/T Washington, LLC  
d/b/a Blanton Turner*

/s/ Marguerite Willis

Marguerite Willis (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
mwillis@maynardnexsen.com  
MAYNARD NEXSEN PC  
104 South Main Street  
Greenville, SC 29601  
Telephone: (864) 370-2211

Michael A. Parente (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
mparente@maynardnexsen.com  
MAYNARD NEXSEN PC  
1230 Main Street, Suite 700  
Columbia, SC 29201  
Telephone: (803) 771-8900

Margaret M. Siller (BPR No. 039058)  
msiller@maynardnexsen.com  
MAYNARD NEXSEN PC  
1201 Villa Place, Suite 103  
Nashville, Tennessee 37212  
Telephone: (629) 258-2253

*Counsel for Defendant Bell Partners, Inc.*

/s/ Ian Simmons

Ian Simmons  
isimmons@omm.com  
O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP  
1625 Eye Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 383-5196

Stephen McIntyre  
smcintyre@omm.com  
O'MELVENY & MYERS LLP  
400 South Hope Street, 18th Floor  
Los Angeles, CA 90071  
Telephone: (213) 430-6000

*Counsel for Defendant BH Management  
Services, LLC*

/s/ James D. Bragdon

James D. Bragdon  
jbragdon@gejlaw.com  
Sam Cowin  
scowin@gejlaw.com  
GALLAGHER EVELIUS & JONES LLP  
218 N. Charles St., Suite 400  
Baltimore, MD 21201  
Telephone: (410) 727-7702

Philip A. Giordano (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
philip.giordano@hugheshubbard.com  
HUGHES HUBBARD & REED LLP  
1775 I Street NW  
Washington, DC 20007  
Telephone: (202) 721-4776

Charles E. Elder, BPR # 038250  
celder@bradley.com  
BRADLEY ARANTBOULT CUMMINGS LLP  
1600 Division Street, Suite 700  
Nashville, Tennessee 37203  
P: 615.252.3597

*Counsel for Defendant  
Bozzuto Management Company*

/s/ Yehudah L. Buchweitz

Yehudah L. Buchweitz  
yehudah.buchweitz@weil.com  
WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP  
767 Fifth Avenue  
New York, NY 10153  
Telephone: (212) 310-8256

Jeff L. White  
Jeff.white@weil.com  
WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP  
2001 M Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: (202) 682-7059

R. Dale Grimes, BPR #006223  
dgrimes@bassberry.com  
BASS, BARRY & SIMS PLC  
150 Third Avenue South, Suite 2800  
Nashville, TN 37201  
Telephone: (615) 742-6244

*Counsel for Defendant Brookfield Properties  
Multifamily LLC*

/s/ J. Douglas Baldridge

J. Douglas Baldridge  
jbaldridge@venable.com  
Danielle R. Foley  
drfoley@venable.com  
VENABLE LLP  
600 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
(202) 344-4703

*Counsel for Defendant CH Real Estate  
Services, LLC*

/s/ Benjamin R. Nagin

Benjamin R. Nagin  
bnagin@sidley.com  
SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP  
787 Seventh Avenue  
New York, NY 10019  
Telephone: (212) 839-5300

*Counsel for Defendant ConAm Management  
Corporation*

/s/ Lynn H. Murray

Lynn H. Murray  
lhmmurray@shb.com  
Maveric Ray Searle  
msearle@shb.com  
SHOOK, HARDY & BACON L.L.P.  
111 S. Wacker Dr., Suite 4700  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Telephone: (312) 704-7766

Ryan Sandrock  
rsandrock@shb.com  
Shook, Hardy & Bacon L.L.P.  
555 Mission Street, Suite 2300  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: (415) 544-1944

Laurie A. Novion  
lnovion@shb.com  
SHOOK, HARDY & BACON L.L.P.  
2555 Grand Blvd.  
Kansas City, MO 64108  
Telephone: (816) 559-2352

*Counsel for Defendant Camden Property Trust*

/s/ Ronald W. Breaux

Ronald W. Breaux  
Ron.Breaux@haynesboone.com  
Bradley W. Foster  
Brad.Foster@haynesboone.com  
HAYNES AND BOONE LLP  
2323 Victory Ave., Suite 700  
Dallas, Texas 75219  
Telephone: (214) 651-5000  
Fax: (214) 200-0376

*Counsel for Defendant Conti Capital*

/s/ Kenneth Reinker

Kenneth Reinker  
kreinker@cgsh.com  
CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN & HAMILTON LLP  
2112 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Washington, DC 20037  
Telephone: (202) 974-1522

Joseph M. Kay  
jkay@cgsh.com  
CLEARY GOTTlieb STEEN & HAMILTON LLP  
One Liberty Plaza  
New York, NY 10006  
Telephone: (212) 225-2745

*Counsel for Defendant Pinnacle Property  
Management Services, LLC*

/s/ Todd R. Seelman

Todd R. Seelman  
todd.seelman@lewisbrisbois.com  
Thomas L. Dyer  
thomas.dyer@lewisbrisbois.com  
LEWIS BRISBOIS BISGAARD & SMITH LLP  
1700 Lincoln Street, Suite 4000  
Denver, CO 80203  
Telephone: (720) 292-2002

*Counsel for Defendant Cortland Management,  
LLC*

/s/ Ann MacDonald

Ann MacDonald  
Ann.macdonald@afslaw.com  
Barry Hyman  
Barry.hyman@afslaw.com  
ARENTFOX SCHIFF LLP  
233 South Wacker Drive, Suite 7100  
Chicago, IL 60606  
Telephone: (312) 258-5500

*Counsel for Defendant CWS Apartment Homes,  
LLC*

/s/ Bradley C. Weber

Bradley C. Weber (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
bweber@lockelord.com  
Locke Lord LLP  
2200 Ross Avenue, Suite 2800  
Dallas, TX 75201  
Telephone: (214) 740-8497

*Counsel for Defendant Dayrise Residential,  
LLC*

/s/ Charles H. Samel

Charles H. Samel  
charles.samel@stoel.com  
Edward C. Duckers  
ed.duckers@stoel.com  
STOEL RIVES LLP  
1 Montgomery Street, Suite 3230  
San Francisco, CA 94104  
Telephone: (415) 617-8900

George A. Guthrie  
gguthrie@wilkefleury.com  
WILKE FLEURY LLP  
621 Capitol Mall, Suite 900  
Sacramento, CA 95814  
Telephone: (916) 441-2430

*Counsel for Defendant FPI Management, Inc.*

/s/ Carl W. Hittinger

Carl W. Hittinger  
chittinger@bakerlaw.com  
Alyse F. Stach  
astach@bakerlaw.com  
Tyson Y. Herrold  
therrold@bakerlaw.com  
BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP  
1735 Market Street, Suite 3300  
Philadelphia, PA 19103-7501  
Telephone: (215) 568-3100

Stephen J. Zralek, BPR #018971  
szralek@spencerfane.com  
S. Chase Fann, BPR #036794  
cfann@spencerfane.com  
SPENCER FANE LLP  
511 Union Street, Suite 1000  
Nashville, TN 37219  
Telephone: (615) 238-6300

*Counsel for Defendant Equity Residential*

/s/ Leo D. Caseria

Leo D. Caseria  
lcaseria@sheppardmullin.com  
Helen C. Eckert  
heckert@sheppardmullin.com  
Sheppard Mullin Richter & Hampton LLP  
2099 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Suite 100  
Washington, DC, 20006  
Telephone: (202) 747-1925

/s/ Arman Oruc

Arman Oruc  
aoruc@goodwinlaw.com  
Goodwin Procter, LLP  
1900 N Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone: (202) 346-4000

*Counsel for Defendant Essex Property Trust, Inc.*

/s/ Michael D. Bonanno

Michael D. Bonanno (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
mikebonanno@quinnemanuel.com  
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN LLP  
1300 I St. NW, Suite 900  
Washington, DC 20005  
Telephone: (202) 538-8225

Christopher Daniel Kercher (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
christopherkercher@quinnemanuel.com  
QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN LLP  
51 Madison Avenue, 22nd Floor,  
New York, New York 10010  
Telephone: (212) 849-7000

Andrew Gardella, Esq. (TN Bar #027247)  
agardella@martintate.com  
MARTIN, TATE, MORROW & MARSTON P.C.  
315 Deaderick Street, Suite 1550  
Nashville, TN 37238  
Telephone: (615) 627-0668

*Counsel for Defendant Highmark Residential, LLC*

/s/ Cliff A. Wade

Cliff A. Wade  
cliff.wade@bakerlopez.com  
Chelsea L. Futrell  
chelsea.futrell@bakerlopez.com  
BAKER LOPEZ PLLC  
5728 LBJ Freeway, Suite 150  
Dallas, Texas 75240  
Telephone: (469) 206-9384

*Counsel for Defendant Knightvest Residential*

/s/ Michael M. Maddigan

Michael M. Maddigan  
michael.maddigan@hoganlovells.com  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
1999 Avenue of the Stars, Suite 1400  
Los Angeles, CA 90067  
Telephone: (310) 785-4727

William L. Monts, III  
william.monts@hoganlovells.com  
Benjamin F. Holt  
benjamin.holt@hoganlovells.com  
HOGAN LOVELLS US LLP  
555 Thirteenth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20004  
Telephone: (202) 637-6440

Joshua C. Cumby (BPR No. 37949)  
joshua.cumby@arlaw.com  
F. Laurens Brock (BPR No. 17666)  
larry.brock@arlaw.com  
Rocklan W. King, III (BPR No. 30643)  
rocky.king@arlaw.com  
ADAMS AND REESE LLP  
1600 West End Avenue, Suite 1400  
Nashville, Tennessee 37203  
Telephone: (615) 259-1450

*Counsel for Defendant Greystar Real Estate Partners, LLC (formerly Greystar Management Services, LP)*

/s/ John J. Sullivan

---

John J. Sullivan  
jsullivan@cozen.com  
COZEN O'CONNOR P.C.  
3 WTC, 175 Greenwich St., 55th Floor  
New York, NY 10007  
Telephone: (212) 453-3729

*Counsel for Defendant Independence Realty  
Trust, Inc.*

/s/ Eliot Turner

---

Eliot Turner  
eliot.turner@nortonrosefulbright.com  
NORTON ROSE FULBRIGHT US LLP  
1301 McKinney, Suite 5100,  
Houston, Texas 77010  
Telephone: (713) 651-5151

*Counsel for Defendant Kairoi Management  
LLC*

/s/ Michael W. Scarborough

Michael W. Scarborough (admitted *pro hac vice*)

mscarborough@velaw.com

Dylan I. Ballard (admitted *pro hac vice*)

dballard@velaw.com

VINSON & ELKINS LLP

555 Mission Street, Suite 2000

San Francisco, CA 94105

Telephone: (415) 979-6900

*Counsel for Defendant Lantower Luxury Living Group, Inc.  
LLC*

/s/ Karen H. Safran

Karen H. Safran

ksafran@goodspeedmerrill.com

Robert S. Hunger

rhunger@goodspeedmerrill.com

GOODSPEED MERRILL

9605 South Kingston Court, Suite 200

Englewood, CO 80112

Telephone: (720) 473-7644

*Counsel for Defendant Lyon Management*

/s/ Britt M. Miller

Britt M. Miller (admitted *pro hac vice*)

bmiller@mayerbrown.com

Daniel T. Fenske (admitted *pro hac vice*)

dfenske@mayerbrown.com

Matthew D. Provance (admitted *pro hac vice*)

mprovance@mayerbrown.com

MAYER BROWN LLP

71 South Wacker Drive

Chicago, IL 6006

Telephone: (312) 701-8663

Scott D. Carey (#15406)

scarey@bakerdonelson.com

Ryan P. Loofbourrow (#33414)

rloofbourrow@bakerdonelson.com

BAKER, DONELSON, BEARMAN, CALDWELL &  
BERKOWITZ, P.C.

1600 West End Avenue, Suite 2000

Nashville, TN 37203

Telephone: (615) 726-5600

*Counsel for Defendant Mid-America  
Apartment Communities, Inc.*



/s/ Jeffrey C. Bank

Jeffrey C. Bank  
jbank@wsgr.com  
WILSON SONSINI GOODRICH & ROSATI PC  
1700 K Street NW, Fifth Floor  
Washington, DC 20006  
Telephone: (202) 973-8800

*Counsel for Defendant Morgan Properties  
Management Company, LLC*

/s/ Richard P. Sybert

Richard P. Sybert (WSBA No. 8357)  
rsybert@grsm.com  
GORDON REES SCULLY MANSUKHANI  
701 Fifth Avenue, Suite 2100  
Seattle, WA 98104  
Telephone: (206) 321-5222

*Counsel for Defendant Rose Associates Inc.*

/s/ Judith A. Zahid

Judith A. Zahid (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
jzahid@zellelaw.com  
Heather T. Rankie (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
hrankie@zellelaw.com  
ZELLE LLP  
555 12th Street, Suite 1230  
Oakland, CA 94607  
Telephone: (415) 633-1916

*Counsel for Defendant Prometheus Real Estate  
Group, Inc.*

/s/ Valentine Hoy

Valentine Hoy  
vhoy@allenmatkins.com  
Scott Perlin  
sperlin@allenmatkins.com  
ALLEN MATKINS LECK GAMBLE MALLORY &  
NATSIS  
600 West Broadway, 27th Floor  
San Diego, CA 92101  
Telephone: (619) 233-1155

Patrick E. Breen  
pbreen@allenmatkins.com  
ALLEN MATKINS LECK GAMBLE MALLORY &  
NATSIS  
865 South Figueroa Street, Suite 2800  
Los Angeles, CA 90017  
Telephone: (213) 622-5555

*Counsel for Defendant Sares Regis Group  
Commercial, Inc.*

/s/ Jose Dino Vasquez

Jose Dino Vasquez  
dvasquez@karrtuttle.com  
Jason Hoeft  
jhoeft@karrtuttle.com  
KARR TUTTLE CAMPBELL  
701 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3300  
Seattle, WA 98104  
Telephone: (206) 223-1313

*Counsel for Defendant Security Properties, Inc.*

/s/ David A. Walton

David A. Walton  
dwalton@bellnunnally.com  
Troy Lee (T.J.) Hales  
thales@bellnunnally.com  
BELL NUNNALLY & MARTIN, LLP  
2323 Ross Avenue, Suite 1900  
Dallas, TX 75201

*Counsel for Defendant RPM Living, LLC*

/s/ Diane R. Hazel

Diane R. Hazel  
dhazel@foley.com  
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
1400 16th Street, Suite 200  
Denver, CO 80202  
Telephone: (720) 437-2000

Elizabeth A. N. Haas (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
ehaas@foley.com  
Ian Hampton (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
ihampton@foley.com  
FOLEY & LARDNER LLP  
777 East Wisconsin Avenue  
Milwaukee, WI 53202  
Telephone: (414) 271-2400

Tara L. Swafford, BPR #17577  
tara@swaffordlawfirm.com  
Dylan Harper, BPR #36820  
dylan@swaffordlawfirm.com  
THE SWAFFORD LAW FIRM, PLLC  
321 Billingsly Court, Suite 19  
Franklin, Tennessee 37067  
Telephone: (615) 599-8406

*Counsel for Defendant Sherman Associates,  
Inc.*

/s/ Brent Justus

Brent Justus  
bjustus@mcguirewoods.com  
Nick Giles  
ngiles@mcguirewoods.com  
MCGUIREWOODS LLP  
800 East Canal Street  
Richmond, VA 23219-3916  
Telephone: (804) 775-1000

*Counsel for Defendant Simpson Property  
Group, LLC*

/s/ Yonaton Rosenzweig

Yonaton Rosenzweig  
yonirosenzweig@dwt.com  
DAVIS WRIGHT TREMAINE LLP  
865 S. Figueroa Street, Suite 2400  
Los Angeles, CA 90017

Fred B. Burnside  
fredburnside@dwt.com  
MaryAnn T. Almeida  
maryannalmeida@dwt.com  
DAVIS WRIGHT TREMAINE LLP  
920 Fifth Avenue, Suite 3300  
Seattle, WA 98104  
Telephone: (206) 757-8016

*Counsel for Defendant Mission Rock  
Residential, LLC*

/s/ Andrew Harris

Andrew Harris  
Andrew.Harris@Levittboccio.com  
LEVITT & BOCCIO, LLP  
423 West 55th Street  
New York, NY 10019  
Telephone: (212) 801-1104

/s/ Nicholas A. Gravante, Jr.

Nicholas A. Gravante, Jr. (admission *pro hac*  
*vice* pending)

[nicholas.gravante@cwt.com](mailto:nicholas.gravante@cwt.com)

Philip J. Iovieno (admission *pro hac vice*  
pending)

[philp.iovieno@cwt.com](mailto:philp.iovieno@cwt.com)

CADWALADER, WICKERSHAM & TAFT LLP  
200 Liberty Street  
New York, NY 10281  
Telephone: (212) 504-6000

*Counsel for The Related Companies, L.P. and  
Related Management Company, L.P.*

/s/ Benjamin I. VandenBerghe

Benjamin I. VandenBerghe  
biv@montgomerypurdue.com  
Kaya R. Lurie  
klurie@montgomerypurdue.com  
MONTGOMERY PURDUE PLLC  
701 Fifth Avenue, Suite 5500  
Seattle, Washington 98104-7096

*Counsel for Defendant Thrive Communities  
Management, LLC*

/s/ David D. Cross

David D. Cross (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
dcross@mofo.com  
Jeffrey A. Jaeckel (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
jjaeckel@mofo.com  
Robert W. Manoso (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
rmanoso@mofo.com  
MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
2100 L Street, NW, Suite 900  
Washington, D.C., 20037  
Telephone: (202) 887-1500

Eliot A. Adelson (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
eadelson@mofo.com  
MORRISON & FOERSTER LLP  
425 Market Street  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: (415) 268-7000

/s/ Joshua L. Burgener

Joshua L. Burgener  
jburgener@dickinsonwright.com  
DICKINSON WRIGHT PLLC  
424 Church Street, Suite 800  
Nashville, TN 37219  
Telephone: (615) 620-1757

*Counsel for Defendant UDR, Inc.*

/s/ Evan Fray-Witzer

Evan Fray-Witzer  
Evan@CFWLegal.com  
CIAMPA FRAY-WITZER, LLP  
20 Park Plaza, Suite 505  
Boston, MA 02116  
Telephone: 617-426-0000

*Counsel for Defendants WinnCompanies LLC,  
and WinnResidential Manager Corp.*

/s/ Craig Seebald

Jessalyn H. Zeigler  
jzeigler@bassberry.com  
BASS, BERRY & SIMS, PLC  
150 Third Avenue South  
Suite 2800  
Nashville, TN 37201  
Telephone: (615) 742-6200

Craig P. Seebald (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
cseebald@velaw.com  
Stephen M. Medlock (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
smedlock@velaw.com  
VINSON & ELKINS LLP  
2200 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.  
Suite 500 West  
Washington, D.C. 20037  
Telephone: (202) 639-6500

Christopher W. James (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
cjames@velaw.com  
VINSON & ELKINS LLP  
555 Mission Street  
Suite 2000  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Telephone: (415) 979-6900

*Counsel for Defendant Windsor Property  
Management Company*

/s/ Ferdose al-Taie

Ferdose al-Taie (admitted *pro hac vice*)  
faltaie@bakerdonelson.com  
BAKER, DONELSON, BEARMAN CALDWELL &  
BERKOWITZ, P.C.  
956 Sherry Lane, 20th Floor  
Dallas, TX 75225  
Telephone: (214) 391-7210

Christopher E. Thorsen (BPR # 21049)  
cthorsen@bakerdonelson.com  
BAKER, DONELSON, BEARMAN CALDWELL &  
BERKOWITZ, P.C.  
Baker Donelson Center, Suite 800  
211 Commerce Street  
Nashville, TN 37201  
Telephone: (615) 726-5600

*Counsel for Defendant ZRS Management, LLC*

/s/ James H. Mutchnik

James H. Mutchnik  
james.mutchnik@kirkland.com  
KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP  
300 North LaSalle  
Chicago, IL 60654  
Telephone: (312) 862-2000

*Counsel for Defendant Thoma Bravo L.P.*

### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on July 31, 2023, I electronically filed the foregoing document with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system, which will send notification of such filing to all attorneys of record registered on the CM/ECF system.

DATED this 31st day of July, 2023.

/s/ Ryan Holt

Ryan Holt